June 16, 2006

Federal Communications Commission Office of Secretary 445 12th Street, SW Room TW-A325 Washington, DC 20554

Federal Communications Commission Office of Secretary 9300 East Hampton Drive Capitol Heights, MD 20743



CKET FILE COPY ORIGINAL

JUN 2 1 2006

FCC - MAILROOM

Dear Sir or Madam:

APPELLANT NAME: Wood County Educational Service Center BEN:16024153

471 APPLICATION #: 463990 Billed Entity FCC #: 001172608 471 Identifier: WCESC-471-05

Funding Request Number: 1284500 Service Provider SPIN: 143028362 (McEwan and Co)

Funding Request Number: 1311052 Service Provider SPIN: 143020095 (BSB Communications)

CC Docket No 96-45

CC Docket No. 02-6

RATIONALE for appeal process based upon receent FCC generalized comments:

The FCC is now directing USAC to complete its review of these applications within 60 days of this Order. While the FCC estimates that appeals granted in this Order involve applications for approximately \$68 million in funding for Funding Years 1999-2005, the FCC stated that this Order will have a minimum effect in the overall Universal Service Fund because the monies for these appeals have already been collected and held in reserve.

The FCC found that "there is no evidence of waste, fraud or abuse, misuse of funds, or a failure to adhere to core program requirements.% The FCC further argued that "denial of funding requests inflicts undue hardship on the applicants and in these cases, we find that the applicants have demonstrated that rigid compliance with the application procedures does not further the purposes of section 254(h) or serve the public interest.%

Not only did these applicants win their appeals, but the FCC gave USAC additional processing directives. These include:

We direct USAC to modify its application review procedures as of the effective date of this Order to better inform applicants of approaching FCC Form 486 filing deadlines and also provide a 15-day opportunity to file the form if the applicant has missed the deadline.

As the effective date of this Order, we require USAC to provide all E-rate applicants with an opportunity to cure ministerial and clerical errors on their FCC Form 470 or FCC Form 471, and an additional opportunity to file the required certifications.

USAC shall inform applicants promptly in writing of a ny and all ministerial or clerical errors that are detected in their applications, along with a clear and specific explanation of how the applicant can remedy those errors.

USAC shall also inform applications promptly in writing of any missing or incomplete certifications. Applicants shall have 15 calendar days from the date of receipt of notice in writing by USAC to amend or refile their FCC Form 470, FCC Form 471 or associated certifications.

USAC shall apply this directive to all pending applications and appeals even if such applications or appeals are no longer within the filing window. The 15-day period is limited enough to ensure that funding decisions are

 tiol of Challes recit <u>0</u> Libit AEODE



not unreasonably delayed for E-rate applicants and should be sufficient time to correct truly unintentional ministerial and clerical errors.

USAC shall also develop a more targeted outreach program and educational efforts to inform and enlighten applicants on the vario us application requirements, including the application and certification deadlines, in an attempt to reduce these types of errors.

USAC shall develop a targeted outreach program designed to identify schools and libraries that have timely posted an FCC Form 470 on USAC,s website but have failed to file the associated FCC Form 470 certification. USAC should also notify applicants that have filed an FCC Form 470, but have failed to file an FCC Form 471 or its certification by the close of the filing window.

The FCC will continue to take steps to reform and improve the E-rate program as part of the *Comprehensive Universal Service Review NPRM*.

RATIONALE presented to USAC and denied on May 15, 2006

Wood County ESC is asking for an appeal decision on the two FRN's listed above (1284500 and 1311052) based upon the fact that the PIA reviewer USAC did not take into consideration a "typo error" which made the contract dates appear to be out of the acceptable window of time as defined by application standards. Documentation was submitted that a fax was sent to McEwen and Company on February 16th of which Mr. McEwen signed that day. The contract letter did have a clerical error showing the contract date of February 17th. This entered date on the contract was a clerical mistake made by Ed Helmlinger who completed all of the work necessary to complete and file the 471 form. Documentation of the date produced by the fax machine is actually on February 16th, 2005. Mr. McEwen asked me if the document had to be faxed back on February 16th, and my reply was not necessarily. As long as he signed the contract immediately (2/16/05), he could send it to me at a later date. Regardless of the date he returned a faxed copy of the contract to WCESC, the clerical error to date entry and fax return should be of no significance. I know and assure that the signing date of 2/16/05 is correct because I was on the phone with him as he received our fax. The clerical error was made by a 12 hour time clock error that was on the computer I was using. Rather than the time being in the PM of 2/16 it was on an AM setting twelve hours earlier. The date on the contract is an "autoenter" feature of all the forms I use to complete the 471 application process.

This is evident for the following resaons:

- a. The attached copy of the postal certified mail receipt dated on 2/16/05:
- b. The attached copies of faxed contracts to McEwen and Company with the fax date of 2/16/05 and contract header date of 2/17/05 (the clerical error.) The contract for BSB communications was signed in person by Rick Biddle on 2/16/05 even though the contract header date is 2/17/05, as well.



- c. I completed all assurance signature, mailed the 471 application and had contracts signed on February 16, 2005. I did not want to make a mistake and not have specific pieces of the paperwork all done at one time.
- d. This was my way of assuring that all paperwork was completed prior to mailing form 471.
- e. I provided copies of the three contracts to Nancy Fontana in January, 2005 by fax as requested.

While clerical errors were made by myself, Wood County Educational Service Center DID in fact have all contracts signed on February 16, 2005 as demonstrated in the data above and documentation provided.

In the very recent past, the FCC has approved appeals and waivers for just the reason I have described in this documentation. We are asking for an overturning of the SLD decision or waiver of the rules on this contract date clerical error.

Sincerely,

Dr. Douglas Garman, Superintendent

Luxles Larnan

Wood County Educational Service Center

1867 N. Research Drive

Bowling Green, OH 43402

wc_garman@nwoca.org 419-354-9010

Edwin J. Helmlinger, Technology Director

Wood County Educational Service Center

1867 N. Research Drive

Bowling Green, OH 43402

wc_ejh@nwoca.org 419-354-9010

FAX 419-354-1146

attachments:Denial letter from USAC, Contract with BSB Communications, Contract with McEwen & Co, Certified Mail receipts showing date of mailing 471 form, copy of Ed Helmlinger's planner



Universal Service Administrative Company

Schools & Libraries Division

Administrator's Decision on Appeal - Funding Year 2005-2006

May 15, 2006

Dr. Douglas Garman Wood County Education Service Center 1867 North Research Drive Bowling Green, OH 43402

Re: Applicant Name:

WOOD COUNTY EDUCATION SERVICE

CENTER

Billed Entity Number:

16024153

Form 471 Application Number:

463990 1284500, 1311052

Funding Request Number(s): Your Correspondence Dated:

March 06, 2006

After thorough review and investigation of all relevant facts, the Schools and Libraries Division (SLD) of the Universal Service Administrative Company (USAC) has made its decision in regard to your appeal of SLD's Funding Year 2005 Funding Commitment Decision Letter for the Application Number indicated above. This letter explains the basis of SLD's decision. The date of this letter begins the 60-day time period for appealing this decision to the Federal Communications Commission (FCC). If your Letter of Appeal included more than one Application Number, please note that you will receive a separate letter for each application.

Funding Request Number(s):

1284500, 1311052

Decision on Appeal:

Denied

Explanation:

• On appeal, you seek reversal of the SLD's decision to deny funding because no contract was in place when the Form 471 certification was filed. You state that the contract dates of February 17, 2005 are clerical errors. For FRN 1284500, you state that you had faxed the contract to McEwen and Company on February 16, 2005. You assert that this fax date shows the contract was signed the same day. For FRN 1311052, you assert that the contract was also completed and signed on February 16, 2005 because, as shown on your weekly planner, you had an appointment with the service provider on February 16, 2005 to sign the contract. You enclose the fax page of the signed McEwen and Company contract for support along with a copy of your weekly planner, which shows an appointment with Rick Biddle of BSB Communications on February 16, 2005 to

sign the contract. You also enclose a certified mail receipt of the mailing of the Form 471 and Item 21 attachments with a postmark date of February 16, 2005.

- Upon thorough review of the appeal letter and relevant documents, the SLD has determined that, at the time you submitted your Form 471 application, you did not have a signed contract in place with your service provider. During the application review, the authorized contact was asked to provide copies of signed and dated contracts. In the response provided to the SLD on January 17, 2006, the contracts provided have a signature date of February 17, 2005. FCC Rules state that a contract must be signed and dated on or after the Allowable Contract Date as calculated by the Form 470 posting date, but prior to the submission of the Form 471. In this case, you have not demonstrated that you have complied with FCC Rules; therefore, the appeal is denied.
- SLD has determined that, at the time you submitted your Form 471 application, you did not have a signed contract for services in place with your service provider(s) for services other than tariffed or month-to-month services. FCC rules require that applicants submit a completed FCC Form 471 "upon signing a contract for eligible services." 47 C.F.R. § 54.504(c). The FCC has consistently upheld SLD's denial of Funding Request Number(s) when there is no contract in place for the funding requested. The FCC Form 471 instructions under Block 5 clearly state that you MUST sign a contract for all services that you order on your Form 471 except tariffed services and month-to-month services. You did not provide evidence with your appeal that, at the time you signed your Form 471, you had signed a contract for eligible services. Consequently, SLD denies your appeal.

If your appeal has been approved, but funding has been reduced or denied, you may appeal these decisions to either the SLD or the FCC. For appeals that have been denied in full, partially approved, dismissed, or canceled, you may file an appeal with the FCC. You should refer to CC Docket No. 02-6 on the first page of your appeal to the FCC. Your appeal must be received or postmarked within 60 days of the date on this letter. Failure to meet this requirement will result in automatic dismissal of your appeal. If you are submitting your appeal via United States Postal Service, send to: FCC, Office of the Secretary, 445 12th Street SW, Washington, DC 20554. Further information and options for filing an appeal directly with the FCC can be found in the "Appeals Procedure" posted in the Reference Area of the SLD web site or by contacting the Client Service Bureau. We strongly recommend that you use the electronic filing options.

We thank you for your continued support, patience and cooperation during the appeal process.

Schools and Libraries Division Universal Service Administrative Company

¹ Request for Review by Waldwick School District, Schools and Libraries Universal Service Support Mechanism, File No. SLD-256981, CC Docket Nos. 02-6, Order, 18 FCC Rcd. 22,994, DA 03-3526 (2003).

² See Instructions for Completing the Schools and Libraries Universal Service, Services Ordered and Certification Form, OMB 3060-0806 (October 2004) at page 20.

Dr. Douglas Garman Wood County Education Service Center 1867 North Research Drive Bowling Green, OH 43402

Billed Entity Number:

16024153

Form 471 Application Number:

463990

Form 486 Application Number:

Wood County Educational Service Center 639 Dunbridge Road, Bowling Green, OH 43402

Date: February 17, 2005

BSB Communications, Inc. 5660 Southwyck Blvd. Toledo, Ohio 43614

Subject:

ERATE Contract for Services, 2005

Form 470 Identifier:

896100000506177

Dear Mr. Biddle:

This letter is to notify you of our intent to purchase the following product(s) and/or service(s) by Contract, under the general terms of Wood County Educational Service Center and state of Ohio procurement processes, using Funding Year 2005-2006 E-rate discounts.

Form 471 Number	471 Request Number (FRN)	Product Code	Unit Price	Quantity	Total Price
463990	1311052	550.2030 InterTel 256		1 .	
463990	1311052	550.5200 Axess 8 Pork WinK Voice		1	
	1311052	550.2255 Access Digital Station Card		1	
					\$
			\$		\$7050.00

The actual purchase and delivery of these products will be contingent upon the award of Funding Year 20045 E-rate discounts of at least a 80% rate, and the District's Fiscal Year 2005-2006 Budget. Upon approval of both of these items, the District will issue a purchase order for the product(s) and service(s) upon receipt of the E-rate Funding Commitment Decision Letter after which the product(s) may be delivered to the District. After delivery is made, the District will submit a Form 486 to the SLD, after which time, the vendor should invoice the District for the costs as defined within this contract.

Please feel free to contact me should you have any questions regarding this letter. We look forward to working with your company on this project.

Sincerely.

pr. Douglas M. Garman Superintendent

419-354-9010

Ms. Gina R. Fernbaugh

Treasurer/CFO 419-354-9010

Mr Richard Biddle BSB Communications

419-866-9999

attached copy: Item 21 ERATE Attachment Identified As: PBX-ug
Bid attachment = BSB-ug

02/16 '05 14:18 NO.599 02/07

Wood County Educational Service Center 639 Dunbridge Road, Bowling Green, OH 43402

Date: February 17, 2005

McEwen and Company 308 West Gypsy Lane Road Bowling Green, Ohio 43402

Subject:

ERATE Contract for Services, 2005

Form 470 Identifier:

896100000506177

Deer Mr. McEwen:

This letter is to notify you of our intent to purchase the following product(s) and/or service(s) by Contract, under the general terms of Wood County Educational Service Center and state of Ohio procurement processes, using Funding Year 2005-2006. E-rate discounts.

List Product(s) here, including product code, quantity, unit price and total price.

Form 471 Number	471 Request Number (FRN)	Product Code	Unit Price	Quentity	Total Price
463990	1284488	Soekris Net 4521-30	\$ 749.50	2	\$1499.00
463990	1284488	Hourly labor charge	\$ 100	12	\$1200.00
			\$		\$
			\$		\$
			\$		\$
			\$		\$
			\$		S
			\$		\$2699.00

The actual purchase and delivery of these products will be contingent upon the award of Funding Year 20045 E-rate discounts of at least a 80% rate, and the District's Fiscal Year 2005-2006 Budget. Upon approval of both of these items, the District will issue a purchase order for the product(s) and service(s) upon receipt of the E-rate Funding Commitment Decision Letter after which the product(s) may be delivered to the District. After delivery is made, the District will submit a Form 486 to the SLD, after which time, the vendor should invoice the District for the costs as defined within this contract.

Please feet free to contact me should you have any questions regarding this letter. We look forward to working with your company on this project.

Sincerely,

Dr. Douglas M. Garman

Supérintendent 419-354-9010 Ma. Gina R. Fernbaugh

Treasurer/CFQ

419-354-9010

Mr. Scott McEweri

McEwen & Company-CEO

418-354-0007

attached copy; item 21 ERATE Attachment Identified As: ESC-1

· Block 4 Egg. U.S. Postal Service™ CERTIFIED MAIL_{TM} RECEIPT (Domestic Mail Only; No Insurance Coverage Provided) Postage Certified Fee Return Reciept Fee (Endorsement Required) Restricted Delivery Fee (Endorsement Required) Total Postage & Fees \$ Street, Apt. No. Greenway FCC Form 471 Services Ordered and Certification Form Block 2 & 3 Block 5 Block 6 Block 4 Entity Number: 160241t Applicant's Form Identifier: WCESC-471-05 Contact Person: EDWIN J. HELMLINGER Phone Number: (419) 354-9016 IMPORTANT Please record this application's information in a secure place for future reference 471 Application Number: 463990 Entity Number of Billed Entity (Applicant): 16024153 Security Code Number: 75753 WCESC-471-05 COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DELIVERY SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION A. Signature ■ Complete items 1, 2, and 3. Also complete Agent YPEARSON item 4 if Restricted Delivery is desired. Print your name and address on the reverse □ Addressee so that we can return the card to you. B. Received by (Printed Name) C. Date of Delivery Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits. D. Is delivery address different from item 1? ☐ Yes SLD Forms
Att: SLD Forms
8833 Greenward
Laurence KS 1. Article Addressed to: If YES, enter delivery audress below: Service Type Certifled Mail ☐ Express Mail

> 1 LAN NNN2 2837 6331 2. Article Number

Registered

Insured Mail

4. Restricted Delivery? (Extra Fee)

Return Receipt for Merchandise

☐ Yes

□ C.O.D.

		•				662-9909
JANUARY 2005 SMTWTFS	SUNI	DAY	MC	ONDAY	4177	UESDAY 24
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Important this month				1	032/333
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29	Don Fisc	nor Hi	Bout	TO A STATE OF THE	Tray :	vication)
30 31	419 6	18 9762	-		9	30 HM
FEBRUARY 2005 S M T W T F S 1 2 3 4 5			W W W W AN ALONE W A TAN MINING WAS AN ADVANCED BY A TAN WAS		J:188-	BAIL F.
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26	, we shall see that the second section of the section of the second section of the section of the second section of the	og gregorier i entragentessem er ar mentet Arten Amelikanske	and the contract of the contra			THE REPORT OF THE PROPERTY OF
27 28	6	037/328	7	038/327	8	039/326
MARCH 2005 S M T W T F S						
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12		. 14 Am 11 mm		Aller to come to the second market with the first of the first of the second se	4. Jul 10. 100. 100. 100. 100. 100. 100. 100.	Andrew Market Anna Control of the State of Section Section 14 control of the State of Section 14 control
13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26		ge and the great process of th				A A AND A COMMAND OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PARTY OF THE PAR
27 28 29 30 11					<u></u>	
APRIL 2005 S.M. F.W. T. F. S.		mi sommindere i samen i de denta de Hi		omedia hakkirida a pina pa mayara parangan dika dadan melebehandi a 14. 11 minga ma masa	***************************************	
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	13	044/321	14	045/320	15 4	046/319
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	constant and the response constant constant of the consequence		department of the second of th	Valentine's Day	REPRE	Polyn !
24 25 26 27 28 29 30		4 / March 1 / Ma	10:30 - Da	info	Cra	t Call of White
MAY 2005	- COM		tale to	slike in FEL	Doo	II FRAILEY
S M T W T F S 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	y				3:20.	>stats)
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28	,			CV		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
29 30 31	20	051/31	Ance	052/2/13	22	053/312
JUNE 2005			Dapa	Presidents' Day		Washington's Birthday
S M T W T F S 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11			3.00	Ing. Dan	Ohio	LIT here
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25			419 23/	3343		
26 27 28 29 30	A STATE OF THE STA					
JULY 2005	# 14th of MA Andrew (Mary Imper A and MA) - 1 color of A color		0.74	r		and the second second second
S M T W T F S 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	27	nearros.	18	059/306	Imports	nt this month
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	L	058/307	4:00 pt	1	4:00	3/105
24 25 26 27 28 29 30			11:62 m	rekel APOL	10	~X

tic mac s agracus							
WEDNESDAY	THURSDAY	FRI	DAY	SA	TURDAY		
2 033/332	3 034/331	4 OPM Goder	08330	5	036/329		
9:30 - Hom. Mar	Approximately 10 specifics 10 specific 10 specifics 10 specifics 10 specifics 10 specifics 10 specific 10 specifics 10 spe	mam.	Mon				
(Bund-Kestie)		CADA					
The state of the s		<u> </u>					
the state of the s	and the supplemental and the s		And a second control of the con	1	A STATE OF THE STA		
	and the second s		and the second s	1	and the second of the second o		
9	10 041/32-	, 11	042/323	12	043/322		
Ash W					Lincoln's Birthday		
SR-instal		s manual transportation of the					
T7= line	Vom & CS como	d			THE RESERVE THE PROPERTY OF TH		
* Water and Committee Comm	cond room	0 /	A 100 A10 , 1, 211 , 100 SWW WAY VIR. 1 A A10 A10	Agrees and agree and agree and agree and agree a	And a supply of the contract o		
	3-115	the					
N. V. Star							
161 2311 Ottiste	048/31	The second contract of the second	049/316	19	050/315		
Kindle and	C. B. Brown	Daug M	050				
mike Abut 10 PM	Jany Carry	q 7m	13343				
BohraM	U VOUS	1414 23	43343				
Deta 1666 202	Po 15-30						
Biggige							
AF4121	724 2 055/3	A 25	056/309	26	057/308		
	7.36 = DIAO		* * *				
all control	MOUSCAR						
	117-W200						
COMPM PULL	nove	<u> </u>					
500 PM = PUIL	A/11/02	<u> </u>			and the second s		
Whoch	Born Kass			-}			
			-6410-0	#			
Lynette:	. A company of the co						
05h.tm 17	14-1						

"TAKE THE "A" TRAIN" On February 15, 1941, Duke Ellington and his orchestra recorded one of big band's all time classics. On this day, "Take the "A" Train" became

the Duke's signature song.

So Helmlinger Wood County ESC 1867 N. Research Drive Bourling Green, OH 43402





Tina

Delivery Point

TW-B204

OMD 06/21/06
14:41:54

Sdr Uood COUNTY ESC

70001530000110367521

JUN 2 1 2006
FCC - MAILROOM

Federal Communications (
Office of Secretary
9300 East Hampton D
Capital Heights, MD
20743